BRAP 2019: Feedback Methodology

Department for Promotion of Industry and Internal Trade (DPIIT), Ministry of Commerce and Industry, in partnership with the World Bank Group, released the Business Reform Action Plan (BRAP) 2019 for implementation by States/UTs. This BRAP consists of 80 recommendations for reforms on regulatory processes, policies, practices and procedures spread across 12 reform areas.

India has aspired to be a leading nation in terms of doing business, attracting foreign investments and easing regulations in the country. Keeping this in view and to measure effectiveness of reforms at grass-root level, a feedback exercise was introduced in BRAP 2017-18. Subsequently, for BRAP 2019, DPIIT has decided to assess States/UTs based only on the feedback received from actual users of services. Thus, the 80 point BRAP 2019 has been devised such that feedback can be obtained on all reform points.

The last date to implement the BRAP 2019 reforms is **31st March, 2019**. States/UTs are encouraged to implement reforms before this date to ensure adequate number of users of online services are available for collection of feedback.

States/UTs will be classified on the basis of the feedback score only. However, States/UTs are still required to submit evidence of implementation of reform points on the EoDB portal. Feedback will be sought only on those reform points, which have been implemented and evidence is approved by DPIIT. No feedback will be solicited on other points.

New evidence is not required to be submitted for reform points which were approved under BRAP 2017-18 as the same status will be carried forward under BRAP 2019. If, the old evidence (under BRAP 2017-18) does not reflect the current status due to modifications in the regulatory regime in the State/UT, new evidence must be submitted for evaluation.
States/UTs should note that the portal will display only feedback score since evidence based scoring will not be done. The findings of the feedback exercise will be communicated individually to States/UTs by DPIIT and published on the portal.

**Methodology**

1. DPIIT shall be obtaining feedback on all 80 reform action points. The feedback shall be obtained either through a face-to-face or telephonic interview with the respondents.

2. The selection of respondents will be done on the following basis:
   a) For general points, industrial estates will be identified in the State/UT from the Industrial Information system. Feedback from industrial undertakings located in the industrial estate will be obtained and States/ UTs will be assessed accordingly.
   b) For user specific points, the list of users of the online systems will be sent by the State to DPIIT. The period to be covered will be from **1st December 2018- 31st March 2019**, that is users should have availed the service during the coverage period.
   c) Feedback on a point for a State/UT will be collected only if the action reform point is recognized as implemented either last year (BRAP 2017-18) or during the current year.
   d) In case of States/ UTs which have implemented a reform after the implementation deadline under BRAP 2017-18 (31st October 2017) or the reform was not accepted as implemented, an evaluation of reform evidence will be done by DPIIT.
   e) In case of States/ UTs which implement such action points after 1st December 2018, the user data base should be from the date of implementation to **31st March, 2019**.
   f) State Government/ UT Administrations are required to submit the list of users by **10th April 2019** in the format given at annexure I.
   g) No feedback will be collected on a point for a State/UT if the number of users for the system is less than 20. In such cases, State/UT will not be awarded any mark for such reform.
   h) DPIIT will develop user category-wise questionnaires to obtain feedback. On the basis of answers received in the feedback interview, scores will be awarded. The
questions have weights assigned to them and the same has already been indicated in the Reform Action Plan shared by email dated 11th October 2018. Also,

i. The questionnaire will contain certain qualifying questions to assess whether any system has been used by the respondent, if the answer to this question is given in negative by the user then other questions of the reform will not be asked to the user.

ii. The questionnaire will be shared with the State/UT only after the results are declared. No request for sharing the questionnaire before the completion of feedback interviews will be obliged, to maintain the sanctity of the process.

iii. The States/UTs are advised to verify the validity of data shared by them. In case DPIIT is not able to reach any user based on the contact details given in the data, such data point will be eliminated from the data set and would not be evaluated. A replacement will then be chosen from the user list provided by the State/UT. If such elimination reduces the number of users to less than 20, such reform point will not be evaluated.

iv. In case, any user contacted by DPIIT informs that the actual usage is by someone else in his organization or through some intermediary, DPIIT will make reasonable efforts to reach such actual users. However, if after such reasonable efforts such actual user is not reachable, the case will be dealt as in point (h) iii mentioned above.

i) If less than 70% respondents inform that they have not felt a specific reform, no marks will be awarded for the same.

j) If 70% or more respondents inform that they have felt the reform, full marks for the question will be awarded. Further,

i. Where any State/UT does not have a regulation, the State/UT will be given full marks if the absence of regulation reduces time and cost of compliance for industries.

ii. Where any reform is not applicable to a State/UT due to its geographical conditions or reasons beyond its control, the reform will be considered as not applicable and its marks will be deducted from the evaluation denominator.
k) The overall score of the State/UT will be decided by the following formula:

\[
\text{Percentage of implementation} = \frac{\text{Total score obtained} \times 100}{(\text{Maximum marks} - \text{NA marks})}
\]

l) DPIIT will not assign any ranks to the States/UTs and will classify them in the following categories:

i. Top Achievers: Scoring 95% and more
ii. Achievers: Scoring 90% and more but less than 95%
iii. Fast Movers: scoring 80% and more but less than 90%
iv. Aspirers: Less than 80%

However, DPIIT will disclose the score for each State/UT and reform wise breakup of the score. The States/UTs will be listed alphabetically in each category.

m) The final classification of 8 North East States and 5 UTs without a Legislature may be done separately by DPIIT.
Annexure 1

Format for sharing user data for feedback under BRAP 2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No.</th>
<th>Reform Number</th>
<th>Service Used</th>
<th>Name of Firm</th>
<th>Contact Person</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Contact Number</th>
<th>Contact Address</th>
<th>Email</th>
<th>Date of Service Used / Provided</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Kindly provide the data in Microsoft Excel compatible format.
Annexure II

This annexure details the calculation of feedback scores based on which the assessment under BRAP 2019 will be done.

For example, a reform action point “XX” has a total assigned weightage of 2. The three questions are being asked for getting feedback on this action point have weightages as shown in column (8) in the tables below. For each question asked, a State/ UT will be marked only when at least 70% of the respondents provide positive response for the same [shown in column (7)]. The final calculated score [column (9)] is the product of column (7) and (8).

Below is a sample illustration of calculation of score for two States A and B for the action point “XX”.

**State A:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reform Action Point (1)</th>
<th>Question No (2)</th>
<th>Total Respondents (3)</th>
<th>Total ‘Yes’ (4)</th>
<th>Total ‘No’ (5)</th>
<th>% Yes (6) = % (4)/(3)</th>
<th>Score (7)</th>
<th>Weight age (8)</th>
<th>Final Score (9) = (7)*(8)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XX</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>90.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>75.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>70.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Score</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**State B:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reform Action Point (1)</th>
<th>Question No (2)</th>
<th>Total Respondents (3)</th>
<th>Total ‘Yes’ (4)</th>
<th>Total ‘No’ (5)</th>
<th>% Yes (6) = % (4)/(3)</th>
<th>Score (7)</th>
<th>Weight age (8)</th>
<th>Final Score (9) = (7)*(8)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XX</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40.00</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>90.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>80.00</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Score</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>